



THE SECRETARY OF THE NAVY
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20350-1000

SEP 28 2023

From: Secretary of the Navy
To: RADM Peter G. Stamatopoulos, SC, USN (ret.)

SUBJ: SECRETARIAL LETTER OF CENSURE

Ref: (a) RDML Christopher J. Cavanaugh, USN, ltr 5830 of 14 Jan 22
(b) RADM James P. Waters III, USN, ltr 5830 of 15 Apr 22
(c) U.S. Navy Regulations
(d) OPNAVINST 5450.349A
(e) JAGMAN 0114a

1. On 6 May 2021 and 20 November 2021, two fuel spills occurred at the Red Hill Bulk Fuel Storage Facility (Red Hill) and subsequently contaminated the Joint Base Pearl Harbor-Hickam water distribution system. References (a) and (b) examined the events leading to these spills and contamination. You served as Commander, Naval Supply Systems Command (NAVSUP) from 19 June 2020 through 23 June 2023. As the commander, you have the responsibility for the satisfactory accomplishment of the mission and duties assigned to your command including proper oversight and inspection of your subordinate command, Fleet Logistics Center Pearl Harbor (FLC Pearl Harbor), which manages and operates Red Hill.
2. You negligently failed to adequately perform your duties as an immediate superior in command to FLC Pearl Harbor, as required by references (c) and (d). NAVSUP did not issue policy guidance concerning qualifications, training, self-assessment, or operational practices at Defense Fuel Support Points such as Red Hill. This failure contributed to the lack of performance assessment and feedback required to ensure proper readiness to respond to a complex fuel spill inside of Red Hill. The inadequate response to the 20 November 2021 fuel spill was the primary cause of the drinking water contamination.
3. You also negligently approved an insufficient investigation of the 6 May 2021 fuel spill at Red Hill. Furthermore, once the investigation was complete you had the responsibility to review the report and return it to the investigating officer if you were not satisfied. You determined the command investigation met your expectations; however, the investigation was cursory, contained little independent analysis, did not recommend meaningful corrective actions, and failed to investigate the response efforts during the 6 May 2021 fuel spill. This inadequate investigation was the largest missed opportunity to properly identify the error in fuel accountability after the 6 May 2021 fuel spill. The failure to fully account for the fuel spilled in the 6 May 2021 incident was the primary source of the 20 November 2021 fuel spill.
4. Commanders are responsible for the proper execution of duties and performance of their subordinates. You failed to identify and mitigate against lack of oversight of contracting and installation of a critical system at Red Hill which contributed to the fuel spill and subsequent contamination of the water distribution system.
5. Accordingly, you are hereby censured for your leadership failures. A copy of this letter will be placed in your official service record per reference (e). You may forward within 15 days of receipt of this letter a rebuttal consistent with reference (e), for inclusion in your official record, if you so desire.

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Carlos Del Toro".

Carlos Del Toro



THE SECRETARY OF THE NAVY
WASHINGTON, D. C. 20350-1000

From: Secretary of the Navy
To: RADM John W. Korka, CEC, USN (ret.)

SEP 28 2023

SUBJ: SECRETARIAL LETTER OF CENSURE

Ref: (a) RDML Christopher J. Cavanaugh, USN, ltr 5830 of 14 Jan 22
(b) RADM James P. Waters III, USN, ltr 5830 of 15 Apr 22
(c) Unified Facilities Criteria (UFC) 3-600-01
(d) MIL-STD-3007F
(e) JAGMAN 0114a

1. On 6 May 2021 and 20 November 2021, two fuel spills occurred at the Red Hill Bulk Fuel Storage Facility (Red Hill) and subsequently contaminated the Joint Base Pearl Harbor-Hickam water distribution system. References (a) and (b) examined the events leading to these spills and contamination.
2. Between May 2017 and September 2018, as Commander, NAVFAC Pacific (NAVFAC PAC), you were responsible for providing oversight and support to Naval Facilities Engineering Systems Command Hawaii (NAVFAC Hawaii). You failed to ensure NAVFAC Hawaii complied with the requirements and procedures set forth in references (c) and (d) during the contracting and installation of the Aqueous Film Forming Foam (AFFF) system (P-1551). You also failed to exercise proper oversight of the NAVFAC PAC team responsible for the engineering, design, and construction management of the AFFF system. These failures resulted in the use and acceptance of PVC piping in the AFFF waste system, an unauthorized material in violation of reference (c). Ultimately, the use of PVC piping in the AFFF waste system was a proximate cause of the fuel spill at Red Hill Bulk Fuel Storage Facility.
3. Commanders are responsible for the proper execution of duties and performance of their subordinates. You failed to identify and mitigate against lack of oversight of contracting and installation of a critical system at Red Hill which contributed to the fuel spill and subsequent contamination of the water distribution system.
4. Accordingly, you are hereby censured for your leadership failures. A copy of this letter will be placed in your official service record per reference (e). You may forward within 15 days of receipt of this letter a rebuttal consistent with reference (e), for inclusion in your official record, if you so desire.

A handwritten signature in blue ink, reading "Carlos Del Toro".

Carlos Del Toro



THE SECRETARY OF THE NAVY
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20350-1000

From: Secretary of the Navy
To: RDML Timothy J. Kott, USN (ret.)

SEP 28 2023

SUBJ: SECRETARIAL LETTER OF CENSURE

Ref: (a) RDML Christopher J. Cavanaugh, USN, ltr 5830 of 14 Jan 22
(b) RADM James P. Waters III, USN, ltr 5830 of 15 Apr 22
(c) CNICINST 5450.8B
(d) OPNAV M-5090.1E
(e) OPNAVINST 3440.17A
(f) JAGMAN 0114a

1. On 6 May 2021 and 20 November 2021, two fuel spills occurred at the Red Hill Bulk Fuel Storage Facility (Red Hill) that subsequently contaminated the Joint Base Pearl Harbor-Hickam water distribution system. References (a) and (b) examined the events leading to these spills and contamination. From 18 June 2021 to 17 June 2022, you served as Commander, Navy Region Hawaii. As the commander, you had the responsibility for the satisfactory accomplishment of the mission and duties assigned to your command to include serving as the Navy On-Scene Coordinator and Region Environmental Coordinator.
2. As the Region Commander, you negligently failed to coordinate a training plan and execute fuel spill drills or exercises at Red Hill, as required by references (c) and (d). Navy Region Hawaii conducted no comprehensive fuel spill response drills at Red Hill prior to 20 November 2021. This failure contributed to the inadequate response to the 20 November 2021 fuel spill at Red Hill, which was the primary cause of the drinking water contamination.
3. Commanders are responsible for the proper execution of duties and performance of their subordinates. You failed to identify and mitigate against lack of oversight of contracting and installation of a critical system at Red Hill, which contributed to the fuel spill and subsequent contamination. You also negligently failed to adequately deploy your environmental management team and conduct an independent environmental risk assessment during the 20 November 2021 fuel spill at Red Hill, as required by references (c) and (d). Despite the fact that fuel was actively spilling for approximately 34 hours, you did not direct the Navy On-Scene Coordinator Representative (NOSC-R) to assess the spill at the scene. Had you ensured a proper environmental risk analysis, the risk to the drinking water system could have been identified before the first reports of contamination.
4. Further, you negligently failed to notify the public that the Red Hill well had been secured, as required by reference (e). After you ordered the well to be secured, you had a duty to timely communicate that pertinent information to the public; however, you did not tell the public that you secured the well until four days after the fact. This delay in reporting negatively impacted public trust and gave some members of the public the impression that the Navy was not transparent in their reporting.
5. Accordingly, you are hereby censured for your leadership failures. A copy of this letter will be placed in your official service record per reference (f). You may forward within 15 days of receipt of this letter a rebuttal consistent with reference (f), for inclusion in your official record, if you so desire.

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Carlos Del Toro".

Carlos Del Toro