



**Restoration Advisory Board (RAB) Meeting
Former Naval Station Roosevelt Roads
Ceiba, Puerto Rico**

Meeting #44 - May 16, 2018

Note: This meeting summary is based on informal notes taken at the meeting. It is not intended as a verbatim transcript. Rather, it is intended to summarize the overall discussions. If comments or additional notes are provided within 30 days of distribution of these minutes, they will be considered and potentially added as an attachment to this summary.

I. Welcome and Introductions

The meeting began at approximately 6:15 p.m. See Attachment 1 for a list of meeting attendees.

Daniel Concepcion (Facilitator) greeted attendees to the 44th Naval Activity Puerto Rico (NAPR) RAB meeting, gave a brief explanation of the agenda and introduced the NAPR Base Realignment and Closure (BRAC) Program Manager, Thuane Fielding (Navy).

Thuane thanked the attendees for participating and for supporting the cleanup program at the former Naval Station Roosevelt Roads; these include members of the Restoration Advisory Board (RAB), the Navy, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), the Puerto Rico Environmental Quality Board (PREQB), and the Local Redevelopment Authority (LRA). Thuane also introduced Mr. Tim Wenk who has transitioned in for Mr. Stacin Martin as the NAVFAC environmental representative for NAPR.

Representatives from EPA, Ms. Jessica Mollin, and from PREQB, Mr. Juan Babá, were in attendance and expressed their appreciation for the Navy's concern following Hurricanes Irma and Maria. PREQB and EPA have been in communication with the Navy regarding the progress of the environmental activities since the hurricanes; no impacts related to the storms were observed; both representatives stated that they look forward to seeing community members at future meetings.

Thuane also welcomed the representatives from the LRA, including Mrs. Nilda Marchán who continues to collaborate with the Navy on the cleanup process and participates in the review and approval phases in support of future land transfers.

Mr. Ramón Figueroa, RAB Co-Chair welcomed all the guests and thanked the Navy for their concerns during Puerto Rico's hurricane recovery.

II. New and Ongoing Action Items

The following table summarizes the status of the action items, including new and ongoing tasks which will be discussed at the RAB meeting.

Action Item Description	Status as of 5/16/2018
PREQB will provide the State Historic Preservation Office contact information to interested members of the community.	COMPLETED: PREQB provided SHPO contact in January 2018. Contact name is Arquitect Miguel A. Bonini Lamadrid, Historic Property Specialist.
Navy will present the data and the results of the ongoing investigations as agenda topics in future RAB meetings.	ONGOING: Navy continues to present results of the completed investigations at RAB meetings.
Navy will describe the Statement of Basis for each site summarizing the investigation history and planned cleanup activities.	ONGOING: As they are developed, Statements of Basis are being presented to the RAB. The Navy and the LRA are currently working together to identify a local repository to store hardcopies of documents for public review (the former repository, the Ceiba Public Library was affected by the hurricanes).
EPA will follow up with the question related to the Toxic Release Inventory (TRI) data within the framework of the Consent Order and public information requirements.	NEW
PREQB will further discuss the watershed assessment related to hurricane impacts.	NEW
PREQB will enquire about role of the agency related to health studies for Ceiba residents.	NEW

III. Post Hurricane Environmental Impact Update

Mr. Tim Wenk (Navy) provided an update of the preparation and post hurricane environmental activities and described the Navy's contingency plan which focus on safeguarding the staff and preventing damage to the site equipment.

Tim discussed the effects of the hurricane using a slideshow with pictures of the damage to the electrical infrastructure, erosion impacts to the coastal protection, and the damage to the office onsite. Tim added that most of the activities scheduled for the last quarter of 2017 calendar year were postponed due to the hurricane damage assessment and recovery efforts; these activities included environmental document review, site restoration and field work. Tim stated that the NAPR environmental work resumed during the first few months of 2018. In addition, Tim indicated that there is no evidence that the hurricanes resulted in the release of contaminants from the sites at NAPR.

Questions/Comments from the Public:

- Naida Dávila (RAB community member) – requested PREQB to discuss information concerning an assessment of the watershed to determine if there were risks associated with the storm runoff from environmental sites.
 - Juan Babá (PREQB) – responded that during the assessment there were no observed impacts or reported releases from the environmental sites due to the storm runoff. Juan stated that he will consider this matter further.
- Naida Dávila (RAB community member) – requested from EPA data and information to the public per the consent order regarding the Toxic Release Inventory (TRI), specifically, her is interest in the information related to the human health and environmental risks associated with the contaminants that have been found or addressed at NAPR.
 - Ms. Jessica Mollin (EPA) – stated that she would follow up with Naida to further understand her request.
 - Ms. Thuane Fielding (Navy) – stated that the Navy has been sharing information about ongoing field activities in a monthly flyer since 2016; and added that the historical records on contaminants related to past activities can be found on the investigation documents posted in the Administrative Record on the BRAC website. Thuane shared the BRAC website address with Mrs. Dávila so she would be able to browse the Administrative Record and search the environmental documents for each NAPR site.

IV. Overview of the Emerging Contaminants - Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)

Tim Wenk (Navy) discussed the regulatory background information, and the definition of emerging contaminants, specifically PFAS. Tim noted that the main sources of PFAS are consumer goods, food packaging, stain/water-resistant coatings, and firefighting Aqueous Film-Forming Foams (AFFF). The PFAS investigation started in NAPR due to the past use of AFFF at the facility, which was associated with fire training, crash responses, and other base activities.

Tim described the chemistry, persistence, and transport characteristics of the PFAS in the environment and how these chemicals will be evaluated at NAPR within the RCRA program. Tim stated that the Navy is in communication with EPA and PREQB to develop a plan to perform the field sampling activities for PFAS areas of concern identified at NAPR.

V. Status Update on Planned, Ongoing, and Completed Activities

Tim Wenk (Navy) provided an update on the ongoing, and completed activities for the months of June 2017 (since the last meeting before the hurricanes) through April 2018. Tim gave a preview of the planned activities for the Summer 2018.

Questions/Comments from the Public:

- Naida Dávila (RAB community member) – Asked for additional details concerning the information published on the monthly flyer about SWMU 11 contamination removal.
 - Tim Wenk (Navy) responded that debris was removed from the building interior, and that the asbestos removal started the week of the RAB meeting. The next step would be to complete the polychlorinated biphenyl (PCB) decontamination, which will be determined by pre- and post-sampling of the floors and walls of the building.

VI. Statement of Basis/ Post Closure Care Plan Public Review and Comment Periods

Tim provided an update on the closure plans for the sites under public review and comment. The documents have a thirty (30) day public comment period. Tuesday, May 29, 2018, marks the beginning of the comment period for SWMUs 27, 57 and 80. Tim added that the next Statement of Basis open for public review will be AOC A, followed by the document for SWMU 3.

VII. Other Question/Comments from the Public

- A community member – expressed his concern about the health of Ceiba residents. He would like to know how the Navy is certain that the contamination has not gone beyond the NAPR boundary and reached other media. He also asked for laboratory studies supporting the conclusion that the health of the community is not impacted due to Navy’s past activities.
 - Thuane Fielding (Navy) – responded that the Navy’s responsibility is to ensure the land and the property formerly known as Naval Station Roosevelt Roads is suitable for human health and environment uses, and to transfer the land to designated entity outside of the Navy’s custody. The limits shown on the map are based on the legal boundaries of the property.
 - Juan Babá (PREQB) – added that he would inquire whether the PREQB has jurisdiction to request a health study for the town residents.
 - Ramon Figueroa (RAB community co-chair) – there is a valid concern about a comprehensive health study targeting the residents of Ceiba. Ramon added that, as far as he knows, that type of study has never been done.
- Rafael Montes (RAB community member) – discussed public health cancer concerns related to people that used to work on the former NSRR. Rafael asked about the entity or person to contact to inquire about information of former NSRR worker health.
 - Thuane Fielding (Navy) – provided the attendees with the information on who to contact about this type of enquires. Thuane added that this information is included in the monthly flyer which is listed under the title “Public Health Concerns During Past Operation Activities from the Department of Justice”. It provides the point of contact to enquire about concerns pertaining to public health.
- Ismael Velázquez (RAB community member) – asked about issues when other community members access restricted areas on NAPR. Ismael expressed concern about LRA not ensuring the public is aware of access restrictions.
 - Thuane Fielding (Navy) – informed Ismael that the LRA is overseeing access to NAPR. Thuane suggested Mr. Velazques contact the LRA and consider presenting the NAPR accessibility issue as a topic of discussion during the LRA town meeting.
- A community member – is concerned that environmental assessments on NAPR were dated 2007-2011; can the Navy confirm that the storm runoff is not contaminated and the fish/land crabs found in the waterways around NAPR are safe to eat?
 - Thuane Fielding (Navy) – noted that those assessments were done under the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) in support of the property transfer;
 - Tim Wenk (Navy) – added that human health and ecological risks assessments performed on each of the environmental sites include the chemicals of concern, the future potential use scenarios of the property resources (including crab and fish consumption), and potential receptors/pathways for each media.

- Naida Dávila (RAB community member) – added that related to this topic, the Mayor’s office provides oversight for the beach activities and has placed the non-fishing signs on the beach. Naida suggests the participants to contact the Mayor’s Office to enquire about fishing/crabbing restricted areas.

VIII. Closing

Thuane Fielding (Navy) thanked again all the participants for attending the RAB meeting. The meeting ended at approximately 7:40 PM. The next RAB meeting is scheduled for August 29, 2018.

ATTACHMENT 1
Meeting Attendees – May 16, 2018

RAB Members	
RAB Community Members Present	RAB Community Members Absent
Ramón D. Figueroa, Community Co-Chair Rafael Montes, Luis A. Velázquez Rivera, José Julio Díaz, Agustín Velázquez, Ismael Velázquez, Naida Dávila	Samuel Carballo, Michael Dalton, Jorge Fernández Porto, William Lourido, Lirio Márquez D'Acunti, Ramón M. Ríos
Community Members Visiting	
Jose Cabán	Danny Velázquez
Jose de Jesús	Gilberto Camacho
Jesús Bonilla	Sophy Pedraza
RAB Agency Representatives	
Thuane Fielding, Navy Co-Chair	Navy – Base Closure Manager
Tim Wenk	Navy – Remedial Project Manager
Doug Pocze (absent)	Environmental Protection Agency, Region 2
Jessica Mollin	Environmental Protection Agency, Region 2
Juan Babá Peebles	Puerto Rico Environmental Quality Board (PREQB) – Federal Facilities Coordinator, Emergency Response Area
Other Agency Representatives	
Adalberto Molina	LRA
Edgar Vázquez	LRA
Nilda Marchán	LRA
William Sarriera	LRA
Manuel José Martínez	Alianza Pro Desarrollo Económico de Ceiba (APRODEC)
Damaris Delgado (absent)	Puerto Rico Department of Natural and Environmental Resources
Santiago Oliver (absent)	Puerto Rico Conservation Trust (Para la Naturaleza)
Carlos Morales (absent)	Puerto Rico Conservation Trust (Para la Naturaleza)
Neida Pumarejo (absent)	Puerto Rico Conservation Trust (Para la Naturaleza)
Support Staff	
Pedro Ruiz	Navy
Jamie Butler	CH2M (Navy contractor – NAPR Activity manager)
Renée Hunt	CH2M (Navy contractor – project manager)
James Frank	CH2M (Navy contractor – project manager)
Barrie Selcoe	CH2M (Navy contractor – risk assessment consultant)
Daniel G. Concepción	CH2M (Navy contractor – facilitator)
Jeff Hansen	TRC (PREQB Contractor)