

~~TOP SECRET CREAM~~ 12-525796

FINAL

Handwritten initials and marks

NINETEENTH MEETING OF

UNITED STATES COMMUNICATION INTELLIGENCE BOARD

7 March 1947

SUMMARY

Action To Be Taken By Board Members

Action to be taken

Responsibility

- | | |
|--|--|
| <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Revise the draft of the U.S.-Canadian C. I. Agreement to include a definition of "collateral material," and change wording of Section VII so as to restrict dissemination of collateral material by the recipient party. Circulate revision to members of USCIB for approval. (See page 7.) 2. When revised draft agreement has been approved (see Item 1 above), conduct exploratory conversation with Mr. Thomas A. Stone, Canadian Minister to the U.S. (See page 7.) 3. Ascertain and communicate to the Chairman, USCIB the official Navy position with regard to Army Air Force representation on USCIB. (See page 10.) 4. Furnish copies of the Air Force request for USCIB representation and the Director of Intelligence, WDGS transmittal memorandum thereon, to State Department, ONI and FBI. (See page 10.) 5. Attempt to give highest priority to the processing of [redacted] traffic. (See page 11.) | <p>Coordinator of Joint Operations</p> <p>Coordinator of Joint Operations</p> <p>Rear Admiral Thomas B. Inglis</p> <p>Mr. G. F. Collins</p> <p>Coordinator of Joint Operations</p> |
|--|--|

Action To Be Taken By Secretariat

None.

~~TOP SECRET CREAM~~

E.O. 12958, as amended
Section 3.3(b)(1), (b)(3), and (b)(6)

~~TOP SECRET CREAM~~

FINAL

NINETEENTH MEETING

OF THE

UNITED STATES COMMUNICATIONS INTELLIGENCE BOARD

7 MARCH 1947

PRESENT:

CIG: Lt. General Hoyt S. Vandenberg, Chairman
STATE: Mr. William A. Rody
ARMY: Major General Stephen J. Chamberlin
Colonel Harold G. Hayes
Captain Mason G. Campbell, Secretariat.
NAVY: Rear Admiral Thomas B. Inglis
Rear Admiral Earl E. Stone
Lt. C. T. R. Adams, Secretariat
FBI: Mr. J. K. Limford, Jr. (for Mr. Edward A. Tamm)

ALSO PRESENT:

STATE: Mr. E. E. Huddleson, Jr.
Mr. William P. Armstrong, Jr.
NAVY: Captain Carl F. Espo
Captain J. H. Wenger
FBI: Mr. D. J. Parsons
CIG: Mr. Charles P. Collins

The Nineteenth meeting of the United States Communications Intelligence Board was held in Room 5105, New War Department Building at 1400, 7 March 1947.

~~TOP SECRET CREAM~~

~~TOP SECRET CREAM~~Item I - Approval of Minutes of Eighteenth USCIB Meeting.

No changes to the minutes of the Eighteenth USCIB meeting were proposed.

DECISION: The minutes of the Eighteenth USCIB meeting were approved as previously corrected by the various members.

ITEM II - Consider Communication Intelligence Relationships that should be established between the United States and Canada.

GENERAL VANDENBERG opened the discussion with the statement that General Chamberlin wished to express the views of the War Department on the proposed U.S.-Canadian Communication Intelligence Agreement.

GENERAL CHAMBERLIN stated that in accordance with the decision of the last Board meeting, the Army and the Navy Board members had drafted a mutually acceptable U.S.-Canadian C. I. Agreement. He said that the War Department position, however, is one not entirely sympathetic to the signing of such an agreement because, in the first place, it is not believed necessary and secondly, the War Department is constitutionally opposed to negotiating any type of an agreement which is not needed. He went on to say that he wished to make it clear that if it is felt by any member that such an agreement is absolutely essential for the execution of our tasks then the War Department will not stand in the way of its negotiation. He said that he had understood from the minutes of the last USCIB meeting that Admiral Inglis feels that an agreement is absolutely necessary if U.S.-Canadian C.I. collaboration is to continue. He stated that if this is the Navy position, the War Department will not block the execution of such an agreement.

ADMIRAL INGLIS said that he does consider an agreement absolutely necessary in this case. He asked for the opinion of the State Department.

MR. EDDY stated that with respect to the processing of diplomatic traffic, which is the traffic of primary interest to the State Department, there appears to be no need for an agreement at this time, but that on the other hand, the State Department has no reason to oppose the negotiation of an agreement. As regards the theory that a U.S.-Canadian C.I. Agreement will be needed as a medium for continued U.S.-British collaboration if and when the BRUSA Agreement must be terminated, MR. EDDY expressed his belief that, if this eventuality arises, there should be ample time to readjust any arrangements for collaboration that now exist. He stated that closer U.S.-British C.I. collaboration in the future seems more probable, however, than termination of the existing BRUSA Agreement. The State Department, therefore, would not now have initiated a move to make a U.S.-Canadian C.I. Agreement, but does not oppose such an agreement.

GENERAL CHAMBERLIN then read an excerpt from the Thirty-fourth recommendation of the U.S.-Canadian Permanent Joint Board on Defense as follows:

~~TOP SECRET CREAM~~

~~TOP SECRET CREAM~~

"Subject to the National policies of the two governments, there shall be a free and comprehensive exchange of military information insofar as it affects the security of the two countries, the circulation of which should be subject to such restrictions as may be specified by the originating country."

GENERAL CHAMBERLIN said that he wished to draw attention particularly to the phrase "military information" in the above quotation and also to note the fact that this Thirty-fourth Recommendation has been diplomatically approved by both the United States and Canada.

GENERAL VANDENBERG asked if the policy contained in the recommendation cited by General Chamberlin alters the Navy position with respect to a U.S.-Canadian C.I. Agreement.

ADMIRAL INGLIS replied that the excerpts read by General Chamberlin merely served to strengthen the Navy position since the Agreement, as now drafted is little more than a set of security regulations.

GENERAL VANDENBERG asked for the opinion of the FBI member.

MR. HUMFORD stated that the FBI supports the War Department position expressed by General Chamberlin.

GENERAL VANDENBERG commented that CIG has no strong feeling either way and remarked that the Navy insists on having an agreement and will not accede without it and that the Army is now willing.

ADMIRAL INGLIS emphasized that the document, as written, is only a working draft.

GENERAL VANDENBERG then made reference to paragraphs 6(c) and (d) of the BRUSA Agreement which state:

"(c) USCIB will make no arrangements with any Dominion Agency other than Canada except through, or with the prior approval of, the London Sigint Board.

"(d) As regards Canada, USCIB will complete no arrangements with any Agency therein without first obtaining the view of the London Sigint Board."

and suggested that, in order to avoid embarrassment by either the United States or Canada, arrangements be made in the first formal contact with Canada, for the United States and Canada to simultaneously notify the British at an early and mutually agreed date.

ADMIRAL INGLIS said that USCIB might notify the London Sigint Board now that it is about to enter into negotiations with Canada for the purpose of concluding a Communications Intelligence Agreement.

~~TOP SECRET CREAM~~

~~TOP SECRET CREAM~~

GENERAL VANDENBERG asked if it would be advisable for the United States to send such notification to the London Sigint Board unilaterally or if it would be better to arrange for the United States and Canada to send such notice concurrently.

ADMIRAL INGLIS stated that there would be no objection and in fact it might be preferable to obtain Canada's reaction prior to notifying the London Sigint Board of our intentions.

GENERAL VANDENBERG then asked if USCIB would prefer to send representatives to Ottawa or to request Canada to send a delegation to Washington.

ADMIRAL STONE suggested that USCIB conduct preliminary discussions with an appropriate local Canadian representative.

GENERAL VANDENBERG asked whether such a representative is presently available.

COLONEL HAYES suggested that Mr. Stone, the Canadian Minister, might be considered an appropriate Canadian C. I. representative since he is cognizant of previous discussions concerning proposed U.S.-Canadian C.I. collaboration.

GENERAL VANDENBERG then asked if the Board would approve the Coordinator's opening conversations on the subject with Mr. Stone.

MR. EDDY commented that as he had received the draft only that morning, he would like to have two or three days to study it before commenting.

GENERAL VANDENBERG stated that this meeting was really to approve the intent of having a U.S.-Canadian C.I. Agreement and that there would be ample time for Mr. Eddy to study the draft and forward his comments.

GENERAL CHAMBERLIN remarked that the agreement draft, as now written, contains nothing more than provisions to govern security and dissemination.

COLONEL HAYES expressed his feeling that, in connection with the proposed negotiations, the decision should be made as to whether USCIB and Canada will notify the London Sigint Board independently or simultaneously.

GENERAL VANDENBERG agreed and ADMIRAL INGLIS commented that Mr. Stone will probably suggest that Mr. Crean, Chairman of the Canadian Communications Research Committee, be brought into the discussions immediately.

COLONEL HAYES then revived the question of whether negotiations should be conducted in Washington or Ottawa.

ADMIRAL INGLIS said that it could probably be arranged to have the negotiations conducted in Washington but that he has no objection to Ottawa as the conference site.

~~TOP SECRET CREAM~~

~~TOP SECRET CREAM~~

COLONEL HAYES asked if there was any objection to showing Mr. Stone the draft of the Agreement which had been prepared.

GENERAL VANDENBERG replied that there would be no objection if it were done with the understanding that the document, as it now stands, is merely a working draft and is subject to change by either party.

GENERAL CHAMBERLIN expressed the view that Mr. Eddy, the State Department member, should be given an opportunity to comment on the draft Agreement before the Coordinator contacts Mr. Stone.

MR. EDDY said that State Department comment, if any, would be forwarded to the Coordinator by Wednesday noon, 12 March 1947.

GENERAL VANDENBERG invited attention to the fact that the BRUSA Agreement defines the term "collateral material" whereas this proposed agreement with Canada does not do so and asked for the opinion of the members as to whether it should.

MR. COLLINS read an excerpt from Appendix G, "Final Recommendations of the Technical Conference for the Implementation of the U.S.-British Communication Intelligence Agreement," in which certain provisions regarding collateral material are set forth.

GENERAL CHAMBERLIN stated that if "collateral material" is not fully covered, the draft should be revised to remedy the omission, and ADMIRAL INGLIS agreed.

MR. EDDY commented that any definition of collateral material should set forth the fact that only material relevant to Communications Intelligence activities is included in order to protect the U.S. against any commitment to furnish collateral material not pertinent to communication intelligence exploitation.

COLONEL HAYES asked if the complete discussion of "collateral material" in the BRUSA Agreement covers Mr. Eddy's point concerning relevancy.

MR. COLLINS then read from Appendix G the entire definition on exchange of "collateral material" as follows:

"1. Paragraph 2 of the British-U.S. Communication Intelligence Agreement specifies that the Agreement governs the relations of the contracting parties 'in Communication Intelligence matters only'.

"2. In the same paragraph it is agreed that the exchange of such collateral material as is applicable for technical purposes and is not prejudicial to national interests will, however, be effected between the COMINT Centres in both countries.

~~TOP SECRET CREAM~~

~~TOP SECRET CREAM~~

"3. In accordance with this paragraph, collateral material is defined as that material from any source other than COMINT which, though of assistance to the COMINT Centres (i.e. "applicable for technical purposes"), is not directly a Communication Intelligence matter.

"4. Consequently, material listed in paragraph 3(a) (2) and (6) of the Agreement, though obtained from sources other than Communication Intelligence, is not collateral material because it is directly a Communication Intelligence matter. The exchange of such material will be unrestricted, except as provided in paragraph 3(b) of the Agreement.

"5. Similarly, information concerning COMINT methods and techniques, which are developed by the COMINT Centres under U.S. or British patent, is not collateral material, and its exchange is governed by paragraph 4 of the Agreement."

COLONEL HAYES commented that the BRUSA definition does make relevancy a prerequisite to exchange.

MR. EDDY said that, for example, any notes on bulletin material inserted as background information should not be considered collateral material.

COLONEL HAYES stated that it is clearly understood between the British and the U.S. that Communications Intelligence channels between the operating centers are not to be used for exchange of general intelligence.

GENERAL VANDENBERG asked if it would be agreeable with the Board to designate the Coordinator to make the necessary revision in the draft with respect to collateral material.

COLONEL HAYES commented that it is also now accepted by the United States and the British that any request for collateral material will specify the technical purpose for which the collateral is to be used. He recommended that a similar provision be included in the Canadian-U.S. Agreement draft.

GENERAL CHAMBERLIN said that the fact that a definition of collateral material is to be included in the draft is not an indication that any collateral material will be exchanged.

GENERAL VANDENBERG stated that the inclusion of the definition is more in the nature of a delineation of that which should not be expected from collateral material exchange.

After an extended discussion on the subject of restrictions which should govern dissemination of collateral material by the recipient party, ADMIRAL STONE suggested that the phrase "other than C. I. processing personnel" should be inserted in Section VII of the Canadian-U.S. C. I. Agreement. Section VII would then state in part:

~~TOP SECRET CREAM~~

~~TOP SECRET CREAM~~

" Such collateral material as may be exchanged or the existence thereof may not be revealed to any individuals, agencies, or departments whatsoever other than communication intelligence processing personnel, without specific consent in each case of the party supplying the collateral material."

All members agreed that this amendment should be accepted.

DECISION: It was agreed that the Coordinator will revise the proposed draft of the U.S.-Canadian Intelligence Agreement to include the above change in Section VII and to add as a footnote to the phrase "collateral material" a definition of that term. The draft, thus revised, will be circulated to members of USCIB for comment. In the absence of notification to the contrary the Coordinator will assume approval and proceed to open exploratory conversations with Mr. Thomas A. Stone, the Canadian Minister, on or about 13 March 1947 to ascertain Canadian views as to when LSIB should be notified of pending U.S.-Canadian negotiations and to invite Canada to send representatives to Washington to open the negotiations. The Coordinator is to emphasize in his conversation with Mr. Stone that the existing draft is merely a working draft which is subject to change by either party.

ITEM III - Consider Army Air Forces Representation on USCIB.

GENERAL VAIDENBERG stated that GENERAL CHAMBERLIN had forwarded a memorandum from the Commanding General, Army Air Forces supporting the latter's request for representation on USCIB. The memorandum from the Commanding General, Army Air Forces and the transmittal memorandum in which the War Department supports the Commanding General, Army Air Force request for representation are attached as Inclosure (A) and (B) respectively.

GENERAL VAIDENBERG asked for comments on this proposal.

ADMIRAL INGLIS suggested that action on the request be deferred until Unification has been accomplished.

ADMIRAL STONE asked if the Board within itself has authority to extend its own membership and stated his belief that it does not have such authority.

GENERAL CHAMBERLIN commented that the authority would have to be obtained from the Secretaries.

COLONEL HAYES remarked that since the proposed addition affects the War Department membership, it would, under the original charter, seemingly fall to the Chief of Staff with the concurrence of the Chief of Naval Operations to authorize the proposed extension in membership.

ADMIRAL INGLIS stated that there would be no objection to the Army Chief of Staff designating any two Army members.

~~TOP SECRET CREAM~~

~~TOP SECRET CREAM~~

In response to General Vandenberg's query as to State Department feeling on the question MR. EDDY stated that it was not a matter on which the State Department would take a position one way or the other, but that perhaps action might be postponed until such time as the National Defense Act of 1947 becomes law.

MR. MUMFORD, for the FBI, concurred with Mr. Eddy's comment.

GENERAL VANDENBERG asked whether he could reply in the Board's name to the effect that USCIB has no objection to the appointment of General McDonald as one of the two Army members of USCIB, but that insofar as Army Air Force representation per se is concerned, the Board feels that no decision should be made until the National Defense Act has been passed.

GENERAL CHAMBERLIN expressed disagreement and stated that the Air Force participates in all other Boards, such as the Joint Intelligence Committee and the Central Intelligence Group and is in on practically all activities of the Joint Chiefs of Staff. He stated that he could not see why it should be excluded from USCIB.

ADMIRAL INGLIS restated his position to the effect that there would be no objection to appointing an Air Force Officer as one of the two War Department members on USCIB.

COLONEL HAYES said that this proposed action, under which USCIB membership would be extended to include an Air Force representative at this time, is merely anticipating the fact that the Air Force will become a separate service. If the Air Force were granted membership on the Board an opportunity would be provided it to participate in the planning necessary to its assumption of separate service status.

ADMIRAL INGLIS commented that he would prefer to wait for the Unification Plan to become law.

GENERAL VANDENBERG asked General Chamberlin if he felt strongly enough on the question to take a vote, record his dissenting opinion and refer the matter to higher authority through respective channels.

GENERAL CHAMBERLIN after referring to the original charter which granted USCIB its authority for existence, suggested that the question be referred to USCICC for study and recommendation.

COLONEL HAYES invited attention to the fact that the original charter designates the Army and Navy members of USCIB by position rather than by name. He suggested that the proper procedure for making the proposed change in membership would be to request the Army Chief of Staff and the Chief of Naval Operations to either add a third Army member or change the position designation of one of the existing Army members. He added that in view of the unanimity principle under which the Board operates, he could see no reason for alarm over the proposal that the War Department have a third member.

~~TOP SECRET CREAM~~

~~TOP SECRET CREAM~~

MR. EDDY, noting that orientation has been given as the reason for extending membership to the Army Air Force, asked what objection there would be to appointing an Air Force officer as one of the two Army members.

GENERAL VANDEBERG observed that one effect of such a step would be to deprive General Chamberlin of the services of his communications intelligence expert.

ADMIRAL INGLIS commented that the communications intelligence officer could be a member of USCIB.

GENERAL CHAMBERLIN said that at present Air Force facilities in the Communication Intelligence field are operated under the Chief, ASA and that it was planned to segregate, insofar as possible, those functions and duties for which the Air Force will become solely responsible in order that preliminary orientation may be accomplished.

COLONEL HAYES remarked that there had been considerable discussions recently as to just how the Air Force will fit in the Communication Intelligence field under the Unification Plan.

GENERAL CHAMBERLIN said that in the War Department the Air Force has been segregated and given adequate representation on the various boards and committees and that it should not be denied representation on USCIB. He stated that the Air Force cannot be deprived of its operating facilities such as Radio Squadrons Mobile and commented that the War Department expects to turn over to the Air Force the Air Military Attache organization. He added that he does not know whether the newly constituted Air Force will operate an organization comparable to the Army Security Agency though it does have a firm interest in Communications Intelligence activities.

ADMIRAL INGLIS said that he would like to know more about the Air Force interest in C. I. activity.

GENERAL CHAMBERLIN replied that Air Force personnel are currently assigned to communication intelligence duties in the Intelligence Division, War Department.

ADMIRAL INGLIS stated that at present the War Department, including the Air Force, is represented by two members and that he would have no objection to the Air Force taking one of the two War Department memberships. He added that, until legislation is passed and it is possible to determine whether or not the new Air Force is going to establish its own C. I. Center, approval of Board membership for the Air Force would be anticipating too much.

GENERAL CHAMBERLIN said that his claim is that the Air Force now has an interest in USCIB.

~~TOP SECRET CREAM~~

~~TOP SECRET CREAM~~

ADMIRAL INGLIS stated that if that interest is great enough, one of the two War Department memberships should be assigned to the Air Force. He said that if the War Department wishes to make an issue of the question, he would consult his superiors.

GENERAL CHAMBERLIN said that the issue had already been made.

GENERAL VANDENBERG asked if it would be satisfactory with General Chamberlin to have Admiral Inglis take the matter up with the Chief of Naval Operations and ascertain the official Navy position. He said that the consensus at present seems to be four to two against the proposal and, therefore, referring the question to higher authority would necessitate a split report.

MR. EDDY asked how the Air Force is at present represented on other Boards.

GENERAL VANDENBERG replied that in the case of JIC, the Air Forces does hold separate membership but he did not know whether the same is true on IAB.

MR. EDDY expressed his belief that if the Air Force is at present represented as a separate organization on the JIC and the IAB, that might be an argument for it to be similarly represented on USCIB.

GENERAL CHAMBERLIN said that the subject problem would not be solved by appointing an Air Force Officer to one of the two War Department memberships on USCIB. He remarked that the Army and Navy organizations are not the same as evidenced by the fact that the Army Chief Signal Officer, counterpart to the Chief of Naval Communications, is not a USCIB member. GENERAL CHAMBERLIN said that he would abide by the Chairman's suggestion that Admiral Inglis take the matter up with his superiors.

ADMIRAL INGLIS stated that he would like to have a copy of General Spaatz' letter and a copy of General Chamberlin's transmittal memorandum. He suggested that copies also be sent to the FBI and State Department representatives.

MR. MUMFORD said that the FBI would withhold any opinion in the matter but would like to have a copy of the correspondence for the record.

MR. EDDY stated that the State Department would also like a copy.

DECISION: It was agreed that prior to any USCIB action on the proposal that the Army Air Forces be granted representation on USCIB, the official Navy position will be ascertained by Admiral Inglis and will be communicated to the Chairman, USCIB. The Chairman directed Mr. C. P. Collins, the acting CIG representative on USCIB, to provide Admiral Inglis, Mr Eddy and Mr. Mumford with copies of the Air Force memorandum request for representation on USCIB and General Chamberlin's transmittal memorandum.

~~TOP SECRET CREAM~~

~~██████████~~ Priorities. (New item not on the agenda.)

MR. EDDY stated that he would like to voice a request, the reasons for which are quite obvious, and that is that the ~~██████████~~ traffic and that of the adjacent countries, be given temporary or emergency priorities.

GENERAL VANDERBERG asked whether it was desired that ~~██████████~~ traffic be given higher priority than Russian.

MR. EDDY replied that his request for top priority for ~~██████████~~ and related traffic is a temporary one which will probably extend for only the next three or four weeks, but that during that period the situation in ~~██████████~~ and Middle East requires that the State Department have the advantage of all information obtainable.

ADMIRAL INGLIS commented that if the State Department feels that first priority should be given to ~~██████████~~ problems, this should be the subject of a USCIB decision.

GENERAL CHAMBERLIN asked Colonel Hayes for an estimate of what the priority shift would involve.

COLONEL HAYES stated that under the joint allocation plan the traffic of these two countries is an Army responsibility, and that he would have to look into the possibility of reassigning intercept coverage.

ADMIRAL INGLIS remarked that promptness in processing and forwarding results would be a consideration.

GENERAL VANDERBERG asked if the State Department representative wished to have the Board direct the Coordinator to accomplish the priority handling or leave it with the understanding that the Coordinator will attempt to carry out the request on the working level.

MR. EDDY replied that the latter method of handling would be satisfactory.

COLONEL HAYES said that the Coordinator would attempt to fulfill the request and if any serious conflict of interests is encountered, he would present the facts to his superior, General Chamberlin, for decision. If it were not possible to comply with the State Department request, which is most unlikely, Mr. Eddy would be notified.

DECISION: The Coordinator will attempt to give highest priority to the processing of ~~██████████~~ traffic.

The meeting adjourned at 1510.

WASON G. CAMPBELL
C. T. R. ADAMS
Secretariat, USCIB

~~TOP SECRET CREAM~~

~~RESTRICTED~~C
O
P
YHEADQUARTERS, ARMY AIR FORCES
WASHINGTON

3 Mar 1947

MEMORANDUM FOR CHAIRMAN, U.S. COMMUNICATION INTELLIGENCE BOARD

SUBJECT: Army Air Forces Representation - U.S. CIB

It is requested that membership be authorized the Army Air Forces on the United States Communication Intelligence Board.

If this membership is agreeable, I anticipate nominating Major General George C. McDonald as the Army Air Forces representative.

/s/ Carl Spaatz

CARL SPAATZ
General, U.S. Army
Commanding General, Army Air ForcesINCL A~~RESTRICTED~~

~~RESTRICTED~~C
O
P
YWAR DEPARTMENT
WAR DEPARTMENT GENERAL STAFF
Intelligence Division
Washington 25, D.C.

5 March 1947

MEMORANDUM FOR THE CHAIRMAN OF USCIB:

SUBJECT: Army Air Forces Representation.

1. Reference is made to the attached request from the Commanding General, Army Air Forces, that AAF be authorized membership on the United States Communication Intelligence Board.

2. The AAF participates in Communication Intelligence activities through the medium of its radio squadrons mobile. The War Department members of USCIB will support the request of the CG, AAF.

3. It is recommended that this subject be discussed by USCIB at an early date.

/s/ S.J. Chamberlin

S. J. CHAMBERLIN
Major General, GSC
Director of Intelligence1 Incl
dtd 3 Mar 47INCL B~~RESTRICTED~~