FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Report No. 20130314-013228

November 7, 2013

Inspector General

United States Department of Defense



REPORT OF INVESTIGATION: MAJOR GENERAL SUSAN K. MASHIKO U.S. AIR FORCE



REPORT OF INVESTIGATION: MAJOR GENERAL SUSAN K. MASHIKO, U.S. AIR FORCE

I. INTRODUCTION AND SUMMARY

We initiated an investigation to address the allegation that Major General (Maj Gen) Susan K. Mashiko, while serving as the Deputy Director, National Reconnaissance Office (NRO), and Commander, Air Force Space Command Element, misused a Government owned vehicle (GOV). If substantiated, this conduct would violate Title 31, United States Code, Section 1344 (31 U.S.C. 1344), "Passenger carrier use"; Department of Defense (DoD) 5500.07-R, "Joint Ethics Regulation (JER)"; and DoD 4500.36-R, "Management, Acquisition, and Use of Motor Vehicles."

We substantiated the allegation. We conclude that Maj Gen Mashiko misused a GOV for travel on part of the route between her residence and NRO Headquarters (NRO HQ) and for travel to and from airports in the National Capital Region (NCR). We found that Maj Gen Mashiko was the senior passenger in a GOV on 196 occasions; of these, 89 trips had an official purpose. Vehicle logs, testimony, and Maj Gen Mashiko's weekly calendars did not identify an official purpose for the remaining 107 trips.

The JER and 31 U.S.C. 1344 require that a GOV only be used for official purposes and identify specific personnel authorized domicile-to-duty (DTD) transportation. DoD 4500.36-R prohibits the use of a GOV over all or any part of the route between domiciles and places of employment. This regulation also prohibits the use of GOVs to airports in the NCR unless authorized for emergency situations, security requirements, or other unusual circumstances.

We determined that Maj Gen Mashiko was not authorized DTD transportation and her use of a GOV for trips between the Pentagon and NRO HQ was essentially DTD transportation. The effect of using a GOV for transportation between the Pentagon and NRO HQ reduced Maj Gen Mashiko's one-way commute from 28 miles to the sentence.

We also determined that although Maj Gen Mashiko was authorized the use of a GOV to return to her place of duty (NRO HQ) after attending meetings or events at locations outside of NRO HQ or to attend medical and dental appointments, her use of the Pentagon as a drop off point was improper and essentially DTD transportation. Likewise, her use of a permanently closed U.S. Post Office, located half a block from her residence, as a pickup and drop off point for various trips was essentially DTD transportation.

We further determined that Maj Gen Mashiko's use of a GOV for transportation to or from airports in the NCR was not authorized. None of the exceptions listed in DoD 4500.36-R apply.

Finally, we determined that Maj Gen Mashiko's use of a GOV for essentially DTD trips between the Pentagon and NRO HQ and to and from NCR airports resulted in unnecessary GOV and executive driver usage that could be characterized as a personal limousine service.

By letter dated September 26, 2013, we provided Maj Gen Mashiko the opportunity to comment on the results of our investigation. In her response, via her counsel, dated October 21, 2013, Maj Gen Mashiko assumed full responsibility for the circumstances leading to the allegation. Maj Gen Mashiko wrote that she should not have relied on precedent for scheduling the use of the GOV and regretted not personally consulting with the NRO Office of General Counsel concerning the use of the GOV and driver. Maj Gen Mashiko also stated NRO did not have written guidance, and once released in March 2013, she immediately modified her use of the GOV to comport. Maj Gen Mashiko also provided statements from several former or current NRO employees to corroborate the lack of written guidance concerning GOVs and upon release of NRO written guidance, she modified her use of the GOV and driver. After carefully considering Maj Gen Mashiko's response, we stand by our conclusion.¹

We recommend the Secretary of the Air Force consider appropriate action with regard to Maj Gen Mashiko.

This report sets forth our findings and conclusions based on a preponderance of the evidence.

II. <u>BACKGROUND</u>

The NRO develops and operates unique and innovative overhead reconnaissance systems and conducts intelligence-related activities for U.S. National Security. A hybrid organization consisting of some 3,000 personnel, the NRO is jointly staffed by members of the Armed Services, the Central Intelligence Agency, and DoD civilian personnel. The NRO is managed by a Director, a Principal Deputy Director, and a Deputy Director.

As the Deputy Director, NRO, Maj Gen Mashiko assists the Director and Principal Deputy Director in managing NRO's strategic and tactical operations. As the Commander, Air Force Space Command Element, Maj Gen Mashiko manages all Air Force personnel and resources assigned to the NRO and serves as the senior adviser to the Director, NRO, on all military matters.

III. <u>SCOPE</u>

We interviewed Maj Gen Mashiko and eight current and former NRO employees with knowledge of the matter under investigation. We examined documents and standards that govern the relevant issues. We reviewed official email messages, memorandums, vehicle usage logs, and Maj Gen Mashiko's weekly calendars and Pentagon access records.

¹ While we have included what we believe is a reasonable synopsis of Maj Gen Mashiko's response, we recognize that any attempt to summarize risks oversimplification and omission. Accordingly, we incorporated Maj Gen Mashiko's comments where appropriate throughout this report and provided a copy of her response to the Secretary of the Air Force together with this report.

IV. FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS

Did Maj Gen Mashiko misuse a GOV?

<u>Standards</u>

Title 31, United States Code (U.S.C.), Section 1344, "Passenger carrier use"

Subsection 1344(a)(1) requires that GOVs be used for official purposes only.

Subsection 1344(b)(9) authorizes GOV use for transportation between residence and place of employment for an officer or employee with regard to whom the head of a Federal agency makes a determination that highly unusual circumstances present a clear and present danger, that an emergency exits, or that other compelling operational considerations made such transportation essential to the conduct of official business.

DoD 5500.7-R, "Joint Ethics Regulation (JER)," August 23, 1993, including changes 1-7 (November 17, 2011)

The JER provides a single source of standards of ethical conduct and ethics guidance for DoD employees. Chapter 2 of the JER, "Standards of Ethical Conduct," incorporates Title 5, CFR, Part 2635, "Standards of Ethical Conduct for Employees of the Executive Branch," in its entirety.

Subpart G, "Misuse of Position," Section 2635.704, "Use of Government Property," states that an employee has a duty to protect and conserve Government property and shall not use such property, or allow its use, for other than authorized purposes.

DoD 4500.36-R, "Management, Acquisition, and Use of Motor Vehicles," March 16, 2007²

Paragraph C2.5.2 prohibits the use of GOVs to transport DoD or other personnel over all or any part of the route between their domiciles and places of employment except as authorized.

Paragraph C2.5.3 prohibits the use of GOVs to, from, or between locations for the purpose of conducting personal business or engaging in other activities of a personal nature, unless authorized.

² National Reconnaissance Regulation 5.1, Government Vehicle vs. Privately Owned Vehicle Usage for Travel within Employee's Permanent Duty Station, March 6, 2009, states that the NRO population includes U.S. Military personnel and that the NRO vehicle policy is governed by DoD 4500.36-R, "Management, Acquisition, and Use of Motor Vehicles."

Paragraph C2.5.3.2 permits the use of GOVs for trips between domiciles or places of employment and commercial or military terminals when at least one of the following conditions is met:

C2.5.3.2.1 Used by individuals authorized transportation between domiciles and places of employment;

C2.5.3.2.2 Necessary because of emergency situations or to meet security requirements; or,

C2.5.3.2.3 The terminals are located in areas where other methods of transportation cannot meet mission requirements in a responsive manner.

Paragraph C2.5.4.2 states that public and commercial transportation to commercial terminals in the NCR is considered adequate for all but emergency situations, security requirements, and other unusual circumstances.

Paragraph C2.5.10 prohibits transportation by a GOV when the justification is based solely on reasons of rank, position, prestige, or personal convenience.

Paragraph C2.8 states that when motor vehicle transportation is determined to be essential to the performance of official business, the following methods shall be considered in the order shown, to the extent they are available and capable of meeting mission requirements:

C2.8.1 DoD-scheduled bus service.³

C2.8.2 Scheduled public transportation.

C2.8.3 DoD motor vehicles.

C2.8.4 Voluntary use of privately-owned motor vehicle on a reimbursable basis.

C2.8.5 Taxicab, on a reimbursable basis.

Paragraph C3.1.1.5 authorizes the use of a Class IV (large) sedan for Directors of Defense Agencies and notes that DTD transportation is not authorized.

Paragraph C4.2.7 permits DTD transportation when necessary for the performance of intelligence, counterintelligence, protective services, law enforcement duties and field work, or when compelling operational considerations, an emergency, or a clear and present danger makes such transportation essential. DTD transportation in any of these circumstances must be approved by the Secretary of Defense or the Secretary of a Military Department. Defense Agencies will forward DTD transportation requests to the Assistant Deputy Under Secretary of

³ There is no DoD-scheduled bus or shuttle service between the Pentagon and NRO HQ.

Defense for Transportation Policy for processing and transmittal to the Secretary of Defense for approval/disapproval.

Facts

The NRO IG forwarded an anonymous complaint received by the NRO IG Hotlink on January 14, 2013, to Investigations of Senior Officials. The complaint alleged that Maj Gen Mashiko lives near the Pentagon and is often picked up at the Pentagon when she has no official business there and driven to NRO HQ in a GOV. The complaint also alleged that on January 18, 2013, Maj Gen Mashiko planned to use a GOV and driver to transport her from the Pentagon to a dental appointment.

Maj Gen Mashiko's principal office is located at the NRO HQ. She also has access to an office in the NRO suite at the Pentagon. She has assigned parking in a secure area for her privately owned vehicle at both locations. The driving distance between NRO HQ and the Pentagon is approximately 28 miles. Maj Gen Mashiko testified she lives in the pentagon, within of the Pentagon.

GOV Scheduling/Policies

Witnesses testified they were unaware of any written NRO policy or guidance concerning the use of GOVs.⁴ Additionally, witnesses related that NRO did not have a written or online request system to schedule the use of the executive fleet of three GOVs driven by executive drivers, which supported the NRO's top three leaders: the Director, Principal Deputy Director, and Deputy Director. Witnesses stated that when one of the executive drivers or GOVs was not available, the executive drivers worked together to ensure transportation, if required, for the top three leaders was available.

Witnesses also testified that the staff frequently scrubbed Maj Gen Mashiko's calendar to ensure her appointments were up to date and the GOV, when required, was scheduled. Witnesses related that Maj Gen Mashiko's telephoned the driver to coordinate the use of the GOV.

Maj Gen Mashiko testified that she had not seen a written policy and did not receive a briefing on the use of GOVs. She related her staff managed her schedule, and she executed the schedule she was given.

Maj Gen Mashiko's GOV Usage

A review of the executive fleet vehicle logs and Maj Gen Mashiko's weekly calendars reflected that from September 2011 through February 2013 Maj Gen Mashiko used an NRO GOV as the senior occupant on 196 occasions. Vehicle logs, testimony, and Maj Gen Mashiko's weekly calendars clearly identified an official purpose that authorized her use of a GOV on 64 of

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

⁴ On March 28, 2013, NRO Office of General Counsel distributed a "white paper" concerning the use of GOVs or drivers while not in a temporary duty status.

the 196 (Appendix A). Maj Gen Mashiko's use of a GOV for the remaining 132 trips (Appendix B-F) required further examination, as detailed below.⁵

Trips Between the Pentagon and NRO HQ

Maj Gen Mashiko used a GOV for 54 trips between the Pentagon and NRO HQ (Appendix B). A review of the vehicle logs and Maj Gen Mashiko's weekly calendars and Pentagon access records reflected that she did not conduct official business at the Pentagon prior to being transported to NRO HQ for 32 trips. Additionally, her weekly calendars reflected that she did not conduct official business at the Pentagon after returning there for 10 trips. Her use of a GOV for 9 of the 42 trips with no official business at the Pentagon were on days she also used a GOV for transportation to or from Dulles International Airport (IAD). Her weekly calendars further reflected that for the remaining 12 trips she returned to the Pentagon where she attended scheduled meetings.

A witness testified that on days when Maj Gen Mashiko had meetings at the Pentagon, the executive staff scheduled the driver to pick up Maj Gen Mashiko at the Pentagon in the morning and transport her to NRO HQ. The witness related that the time of the Pentagon meeting, either morning or afternoon, did not matter. The witness provided that when Maj Gen Mashiko had an afternoon meeting at the Pentagon, she was transported by GOV in the morning from the Pentagon to NRO HQ where she performed her duty day, and in the afternoon she returned to the Pentagon where she attended the scheduled meeting. The witness stated, "That's what we had been doing."

Maj Gen Mashiko testified she did not seek specific guidance from the general counsel. She stated that when she had an afternoon meeting at the Pentagon, she assumed it was okay to be picked up at the Pentagon in the morning and driven to NRO HQ and later returned to the Pentagon for the meeting. Maj Gen Mashiko also testified her schedule changed frequently during the day. She stated her staff would not purposely schedule the GOV to transport her between the Pentagon and NRO HQ unless she had a meeting scheduled at the Pentagon or outside of NRO HQ. She related that she depended on her staff to ensure her trips were in compliance with regulations and policies, and that she executed the schedule she was given. She added, "I have no problems driving myself [to NRO HQ]."

Miscellaneous Trips to the Pentagon or NRO HQ

Maj Gen Mashiko used a GOV for 6 trips to the Pentagon or NRO HQ (Appendix C). At the end of the duty day on April 27, June 4, July 2, and September 27, 2012, and January 8, 2013, Maj Gen Mashiko used a GOV for 5 trips to the Pentagon after attending meetings at locations outside of NRO HQ. A review of Maj Gen Mashiko's weekly calendars reflected that she did not conduct official business at the Pentagon on these days. Additionally, the driver's log reflected that on the morning of November 1, 2012, Maj Gen Mashiko used a GOV for 1 trip to NRO HQ that originated at the former Post Office.⁶

⁵ The term "trip" is used in this report to identify each instance Maj Gen Mashiko used a GOV to travel from a start point directly to a stop point.

Trips to Medical and Dental Appointments

Maj Gen Mashiko used a GOV for 14 trips to or from medical and dental appointments (Appendix D). A review of Maj Gen Mashiko's weekly calendars reflected that 5 of these trips originated or ended at the Pentagon on days that she did not conduct official business at the Pentagon.

Air Force Instruction 24-301, "Vehicle Operations," dated November 1, 2008 (current as of August 17, 2012), permits Maj Gen Mashiko to use GOV transportation to and from medical or dental appointments required by the U.S. Air Force.

One witness testified that a GOV could be used to attend medical appointments required by the U.S. Air Force. Maj Gen Mashiko testified that medical and dental appointments for military personnel were considered "duty." She added that the recent NRO policy authorized the use of a GOV to attend those appointments.

Trips to and from NCR Airports

A review of the vehicle logs and Maj Gen Mashiko's weekly calendars reflected that while on official travel, Maj Gen Mashiko used a GOV for 50 trips to or from NCR airports (Appendix E).

A witness testified that using the GOV to transport Maj Gen Mashiko to and from the airport was "allowed" because "that's the way it was done." Another witness testified that using the GOV to travel to "the airport was allowed" and added that use of the GOV was related to security concerns. A third witness testified that the use of the GOV to transport Maj Gen Mashiko was permissible:

[I]t was a mission essential requirement to make her schedule work ... if she was traveling on behalf of the Air Force or the NRO, that was considered official business based on how we operated.

Witness testimony, vehicle logs, and Maj Gen Mashiko's calendar reflected that 3 of the 50 trips were between Reagan National Airport and the former 000,000 Post Office. A witness recalled that 000,000 Post Office. A transported Maj Gen Mashiko in a GOV for 3 trips between the airport and the 000,000 Maj Gen Mashiko were picked up by GOV at Reagan National Airport and during their ride back to NRO HQ, Maj Gen Mashiko was dropped off at the 000,000 Post Office.

Maj Gen Mashiko testified she was under the impression that using a GOV to travel to the airport was acceptable and her staff scheduled it that way. She added she did not seek any legal advice because she assumed her staff accurately and correctly scheduled the use of the GOV. Maj Gen Mashiko also testified that she lives

. She related that she did not know who on her staff made the decision to use the Post Office and "assumed it was okay." When asked why she did not seek advice on using the Post Office as a pickup and drop off location, Maj Gen Mashiko responded, "it was a Government building and it was not my domicile."

Trips to and from Miscellaneous Locations

Witness testimony, vehicle logs, and Maj Gen Mashiko's calendar reflected that Maj Gen Mashiko used a GOV for 8 trips to or from miscellaneous locations (Appendix F).

On Saturday, September 17, 2011, Maj Gen Mashiko used a GOV for transportation to and from the NRO 50th Anniversary Celebration held at the Air and Space Museum near Dulles International Airport. 000,000 up Maj Gen Mashiko at the 000,000Post Office and drove her to the 50th Anniversary Celebration, and following the event, 00 dropped her back off at the 000,0000 Post Office.

Maj Gen Mashiko testified she was one of the hosts for the 50th Anniversary Celebration. She confirmed that all NRO employees were invited to the celebration and the majority of attendees used their privately owned vehicles to travel to the event. When asked for her rationale on using a GOV instead of using her privately owned vehicle to attend the celebration, Maj Gen Mashiko responded, "it was a work event."

Maj Gen Mashiko used a GOV to attend three separate events (6 trips) in Washington, D.C. Maj Gen Mashiko's calendar reflected that for the first event, a dinner held at the National Geographic Museum on April 30, 2012, her use of a GOV originated at NRO HQ and ended at the Pentagon. For the second event, held at the Japanese ambassador's residence on July 1, 2012, her use of a GOV originated and ended at NRO HQ. Maj Gen Mashiko testified her invitation to a dinner in honor of the Japanese Prime Minister came from the Secretary of State. She also testified that she was invited to the ambassador's residence to attend an afternoon barbeque where she conducted relations-building with the ambassador and the Japanese defense attaché. For the third event, the anniversary celebration of the first Atlas V launch held at the Air and Space Museum on September 20, 2012, Maj Gen Mashiko's use of a GOV originated at NRO HQ and ended at the Pentagon.

Examples of GOV and Executive Driver Usage

NRO GOVs are garaged at NRO HQ, which required the executive driver to transport an empty GOV to or from Maj Gen Mashiko's pickup or drop off locations. The table below highlights the GOV and executive driver usage required to support a sampling of Maj Gen Mashiko's various trips.

| Date | Departure Time | Arrival Time | Remarks |
|------------------|-------------------|-----------------|--|
| Friday, February | 0500 | 0535 | Driver transported GOV from NRO HQ to the Pentagon |
| 3, 2012 | 0620 | 0655 | Transported Maj Gen Mashiko to NRO HQ |
| | 1715 | 1820 | Transported Maj Gen Mashiko to the Pentagon |
| | 1825 | 1925 | Driver returned GOV to NRO HQ |
| Saturday, | 1930 | 1945 | Driver transported GOV from NRO HQ to IAD |
| September 15, | 2135 | 2205 | Transported Maj Gen Mashiko to the Pentagon |
| 2012 | 2210 | 2240 | Driver returned GOV to NRO HQ |
| Sunday, October | 1330 | 1430 | Driver transported GOV from NRO HQ to the Pentagon |
| 14, 2012 | 1500 | 1530 | Transported Maj Gen Mashiko to IAD |
| | 1535 | 1550 | Driver returned GOV to NRO HQ |
| Monday, | 1540 | 1600 | Driver transported GOV from NRO HQ to IAD |
| October 15, | 2215 | 2310 | Transported Maj Gen Mashiko to the Pentagon |
| 2012 | 2311 | 2355 | Driver returned GOV to NRO HQ |
| Wednesday, | 0510 | 0540 | Driver transported GOV from NRO HQ to the Pentagon |
| November 28, | 0725 | 0755 | Transported Maj Gen Mashiko to IAD |
| 2012 | 0756 | 0810 | Driver returned GOV to NRO HQ |

GOV and Executive Driver Usage

Discussion

We conclude that Maj Gen Mashiko misused a GOV for travel on part of the route between her residence and NRO HQ and for travel to and from airports in the NCR.

We found that Maj Gen Mashiko was the senior passenger in a GOV on 196 occasions; of these, 64 trips had a clear official purpose. Vehicle logs, testimony, and Maj Gen Mashiko's weekly calendars identified an official purpose for an additional 25 trips: 12 trips from NRO HQ to the Pentagon to attend afternoon meetings; 9 trips to or from scheduled medical and dental appointments; and 4 trips related to events held in Washington, D.C. that originated or ended at NRO HQ.

Vehicle logs, testimony, and Maj Gen Mashiko's weekly calendars did not identify an official purpose for the remaining 107 trips: 42 trips between the Pentagon and NRO HQ; 5 return trips to the Pentagon; 1 morning trip to NRO HQ; 5 trips to or from scheduled medical and dental appointments; 50 trips to or from airports in the NCR; 2 trips associated with the NRO 50th Anniversary Celebration; 1 trip to the Pentagon after a dinner, hosted by the Secretary of State, in honor of the Japanese Prime Minister; and 1 trip to the Pentagon after the anniversary celebration for the first Atlas V launch. We also found that one of the morning trips to NRO HQ, 3 of the trips to or from NCR airports, and the trips associated with the 50th Anniversary

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Celebration either originated or ended at a permanently closed U.S. Post Office located from Maj Gen Mashiko's residence.

We further found that Maj Gen Mashiko lives within **a second** of the Pentagon and is not authorized DTD transportation. Additionally, the Pentagon and the permanently closed U.S. Post Office are both located on the route between Maj Gen Mashiko's residence and NRO HQ.

Witnesses testified that NRO did not have a written policy or procedure concerning the use of GOVs. Witnesses also testified that on days when Maj Gen Mashiko had meetings at the Pentagon during the duty day, they arranged to have her transported by GOV in the morning from the Pentagon to NRO HQ and in the afternoon or end of duty day returned to the Pentagon. Witnesses stated that using the GOV to transport Maj Gen Mashiko to an airport in the NCR was permissible because "it was a mission essential requirement to make her schedule work."

Maj Gen Mashiko testified that she depended on her staff to ensure her trips were in compliance and that she executed the schedule she was given. Maj Gen Mashiko also testified that she did not seek legal advice because she assumed her staff accurately and correctly scheduled the use of the GOV. Maj Gen Mashiko further testified that she "assumed it was okay" to use the **GOV** Post Office as a pickup and drop off location because "it was a Government building and it was not my domicile."

Finally, we found that Maj Gen Mashiko's unauthorized trips originating or ending at locations other than NRO HQ resulted in additional GOV usage as it required an executive driver to transport an empty GOV from or to NRO HQ.

The JER and 31 U.S.C. 1344 require that a GOV only be used for official purposes and identify specific personnel authorized DTD transportation. The JER requires employees to protect and conserve Government property and prohibits the use of a GOV based solely on reasons of rank, position, prestige, or personal convenience. The JER and DoD 4500.36-R prohibit use of a GOV for DTD transportation unless authorized. DoD 4500.36-R further prohibits the use of a GOV over all or any part of the route between domiciles and places of employment. This regulation also prohibits the use of GOVs to airports in the NCR unless authorized for emergency situations, security requirements, or other unusual circumstances.

We determined that Maj Gen Mashiko was not authorized DTD transportation and her use of a GOV for 42 trips between the Pentagon and NRO HQ was essentially DTD transportation. The effect of using a GOV for transportation between the Pentagon and NRO HQ reduced Maj Gen Mashiko's one-way commute from 28 miles to

We also determined that although Maj Gen Mashiko was authorized the use of a GOV to return to her place of duty (NRO HQ) after attending meetings or events at locations outside of NRO HQ or to attend medical and dental appointments, her use of the Pentagon as a drop off point was improper and essentially DTD transportation. Likewise, her use of a permanently closed U.S. Post Office, located from the residence, as a pickup and drop off point for various trips was essentially DTD transportation.

We further determined that Maj Gen Mashiko's use of a GOV for transportation to or from airports in the NCR was not authorized. None of the exceptions listed in DoD 4500.36-R apply.

Finally, we determined that Maj Gen Mashiko's use of a GOV for essentially DTD trips between the Pentagon and NRO HQ and to and from NCR airports resulted in unnecessary GOV and executive driver usage that could be characterized as a personal limousine service.

Accordingly, Maj Gen Mashiko violated 31 U.S.C. 1344, the JER, and DoD 4500.36-R by using a GOV for travel on part of the route between her residence and NRO HQ and for travel to and from airports in the NCR.

Response to Tentative Conclusion

Maj Gen Mashiko assumed full responsibility for the circumstances leading to the allegation. Maj Gen Mashiko wrote that she should not have relied on precedent for scheduling the use of the GOV and regretted not personally consulting with NRO Office of General Counsel concerning the use of the GOV and driver. Maj Gen Mashiko also stated NRO did not have written guidance, and once released in March 2013, she immediately modified her use of the GOV to comport. Maj Gen Mashiko also provided statements from four former or current NRO employees to corroborate the lack of written guidance concerning GOVs and upon release of NRO written guidance she modified her use of the GOV and driver. These statements were consistent with and did not refute the testimony and documents obtained during the investigation. After carefully considering Maj Gen Mashiko's response, we stand by our conclusion.

V. OTHER MATTERS

(b)(6), (b)(7)(C)

VI. <u>CONCLUSION</u>

Maj Gen Mashiko misused a GOV.

VII. <u>RECOMMENDATION</u>

The Secretary of the Air Force consider appropriate action with regard to Maj Gen Mashiko.

| Appendix A. Maj | Gen Mashiko's | GOV Official Trips |
|-----------------|---------------|--------------------|
|-----------------|---------------|--------------------|

| # Date (b)(3), 10 U.S.C. § 424 | Departure Time | From | Arrival Time | То | Day | Time of Day | Remarks |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------|------|-----------------|----|-----|----------------|---------|
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |

| # Date | Departure Time | From | Arrival Time | То | Day | Time of Day | Remarks | |
|------------------------------------|-------------------|------|-----------------|----|-----|----------------|---------|--|
| , (0), 10-0.0.0. 3 42 4 | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |

| # Date (b)(3), 10 U.S.C. § 424 | Departure Time | From | Arrival Time | То | Day | Time of Dav | Remarks | |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------|------|-----------------|----|-----|----------------|---------|--|
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |

| # (b)(3) | Date 10 U.S.C. § 424 | Departure Time | From | Arrival Time | То | Day | Time of Dav | Remarks |
|-------------|-------------------------|-------------------|------|-----------------|----|-----|----------------|---------|
| (-/(-/) | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |

| # Dat | Time | From | Arrival Time | То | Day | Time of Day | Remarks |
|-------------------|-------|------|-----------------|----|-----|-------------|---------|
| (b)(3), 10 U.S.C. | § 424 | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |

| <u>!</u> | Date U.S.C. § 424 | Departure Time | From | Arrival Time | То | Day | Time of Dav | Remarks |
|----------|----------------------|-------------------|------|-----------------|----|-----|----------------|---------|
| 10 | 0.3.0. 9 424 | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |

Appendix D. Maj Gen Mashiko's GOV Medical and Dental Trips

| # Date (b)(3), 10 U.S.C. § 424 | Departure Time | From | Arrival Time | То | Day | Time of Dav | Remarks |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------|------|-----------------|----|-----|----------------|---------|
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |

| # | Date | Departure Time | From | Arrival Time | То | Day | Time of Dav | Remarks |
|---------|----------------|-------------------|------|-----------------|----|-----|----------------|---------|
| (3), 10 | J U.S.C. § 424 | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |

| # Date Depart | ture From | Arrival Time | То | Day | Time of Day | Remarks |
|------------------------|--------------|-----------------|----|-----|----------------|---------|
| b)(3), 10 U.S.C. § 424 | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |

(b)(6), (b)(7)(C)

| Appendix G. ^{(b)(6), (b)(7)(C)} | | I |
|--|--|---|
| (b)(6), (b)(7)(C) | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY Report No. 20130314-013228



Inspector General Department of Defense

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY